

JAMES M. WAGSTAFFE (95535)  
Email: wagstaffe@kerrwagstaffe.com

IVO LABAR (203492)  
Email: labar@kerrwagstaffe.com

ADRIAN J. SAWYER (203712)  
Email: sawyer@kerrwagstaffe.com

**KERR & WAGSTAFFE LLP**  
100 Spear Street, 18th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94105-1528  
Telephone: (415) 371-8500  
Fax: (415) 371-0500

Attorneys for Plaintiff  
GOTHAM CITY ONLINE, LLC

**QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART & SULLIVAN, LLP**

Claude M. Stern (96737)  
Email: claudestern@quinnemanuel.com

Evette D. Pennypacker (203515)  
Email: evettepennypacker@quinnemanuel.com

555 Twin Dolphin Drive, 5th Floor  
Redwood Shores, California 94065-2139

Telephone: (650) 801-5000

Facsimile: (650) 801-5100

Meagan Bellshaw (257875)  
Email: meaganbellshaw@quinnemanuel.com

Rebecca Bers (287111)  
Email: rebeccabers@quinnemanuel.com

50 California Street, 22nd Floor  
San Francisco, California 94111

Telephone: (415) 875-6600

Facsimile: (415) 875-6700

Attorneys for Defendant  
ART.COM, INC.

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
**NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

GOTHAM CITY ONLINE, LLC, a Delaware  
limited liability company,

Plaintiff,

v.

ART.COM, INC., a Delaware corporation, and  
Does 1-50,

Defendant.

Case No. 3:14-cv-00991-JSW

**STIPULATION AND ~~PROPOSED~~  
ORDER REGARDING  
PRESERVATION, REVIEW AND  
PRODUCTION OF CERTAIN  
ELECTRONICALLY STORED  
INFORMATION**

1 WHEREAS, this Court ruled on March 26, 2014 that certain Electronically Stored  
2 Information (ESI) currently maintained by Evolve Discovery should not be accessed by Evolve  
3 Discovery or any other party pending further order of the Court;

4 WHEREAS, subject to the approval of the Court, the Parties have agreed to a protocol for  
5 determining whether the ESI contains privileged, confidential, proprietary or personal  
6 information of either party and for the return of such information to the proper party;

7 WHEREAS, nothing in this ESI protocol or the Parties' stipulation, including but not  
8 limited to Evolve's or any other mutually agreed-to third party vendor's continued possession of  
9 ESI, shall be considered a waiver of any claim to privilege, confidentiality, ownership or privacy  
10 of any ESI;

11 WHEREAS, this ESI protocol is intended by the Parties to be a first effort at resolving  
12 any issues regarding the character and/ownership of the data or materials in the ESI held by  
13 Evolve, and nothing in this ESI protocol or stipulation is intended or shall be construed to  
14 prevent additional procedures or protocols from being adopted by the Parties or ordered by the  
15 Court should either of the Parties hereto determine or believe that the procedure described in this  
16 stipulation be inadequate for any purpose.

17 NOW THEREFORE, the Parties stipulate as follows:

- 18 1. Evolve Discovery, or another third party vendor as mutually-agreed upon by the  
19 Parties, shall produce an index of the ESI;
- 20 2. The index shall be limited to the following identifying information:
  - 21 a. Name
  - 22 b. File extension
  - 23 c. Description
  - 24 d. Date Created
  - 25 e. Date Last Accessed
  - 26 f. Date Last written
  - 27 g. Logical size
  - 28 h. File Identifier

i. Hash Value

j. Full Path

3. The Parties shall jointly review the index. The Parties shall identify any claimed privileged, confidential, proprietary or personal ESI;
4. The Parties shall meet and confer in an effort to agree on the return of the ESI to the proper party;
5. If the Parties are unable to agree to the return of the ESI (or any of it), Evolve or any other third party vendor the Parties agree to shall maintain the ESI for which return is unresolved, neither party (or its attorneys) shall have any access to such ESI pending resolution of how and to whom the ESI is to be returned, and the return of any such ESI shall be decided by the arbitrator(s) in the pending proceeding captioned as: *Art.com v. Garriss, Topkins, and Hersh, and Gotham City Online*, AAA Case No. 74 523 Y 120 14 AMCH;
6. Costs for administering the index shall be borne equally by the Parties.

DATED: April 24, 2014

**KERR & WAGSTAFFE LLP**

By /s/  
IVO LABAR

Attorneys for Plaintiff  
GOTHAM CITY ONLINE, LLC

DATED: April 24, 2014

**QUINN EMANUEL URQUHART &  
SULLIVAN, LLP**

By /s/  
CLAUDE M. STERN  
EVETTE D. PENNYPACKER


Attorneys for Defendant  
ART.COM, INC.

**[PROPOSED] ORDER**

Pursuant to the Parties' stipulation, ~~it is hereby ordered that:~~

**IT IS SO ORDERED.**

Dated: April 25, 2014

  
Honorable Jeffrey S. White